

Center on Teaching and Learning College of Education, University of Oregon

## A Consumer's Guide to Analyzing a Core Reading Program Grades K-3: A Critical Elements Analysis August, 2006

Deborah C. Simmons, Ph.D. Texas A&M University Edward J. Kame'enui, Ph.D. University of Oregon

The selection and adoption of an effective, research-based core reading program in the primary grades is a critical step in the development of an effective school wide reading initiative. The investment in identifying a core program that aligns with research and fits the needs of learners in your school will reap long-term benefits for children's reading acquisition and development.

A critical review of reading programs requires objective and in-depth analysis. For these reasons, we offer the following recommendations and procedures for analyzing critical elements of programs. First, we address questions regarding the importance and process of a core program. Following, we specify the criteria for program evaluation organized by grade level and reading dimensions. Further, we offer guidelines regarding instructional time, differentiated instruction, and assessment. We trust you will find these guidelines useful and usable in this significant professional process.

#### 1. What is a core reading program?

A core reading program is the primary instructional tool that teachers use to teach children to learn to read and ensure they reach reading levels that meet or exceed grade-level standards. A core program should address the instructional needs of the majority of students in a respective school or district.

Historically, core-reading programs have been referred to as basal reading programs in that they serve as the "base" for reading instruction. Adoption of a core does not imply that other materials and strategies are not used to provide a rich, comprehensive program of instruction. The core program, however, should serve as the primary reading program for the school and the expectation is that all teachers within and between the primary grades will use the core program as the base of reading instruction. Such programs may or may not be commercial textbook series.

#### 2. Why adopt a core reading program?

In a document entitled "Teaching Reading is Rocket Science," Louisa Moats (1999) articulated the complexities of carefully designed and implemented reading instruction. Teaching reading is far more complex than most professionals and laypersons realize. The demands of the phonologic, alphabetic, semantic, and syntactic systems of written language require a careful schedule and sequence of prioritized objectives, explicit strategies, and scaffolds that support students' initial learning and transfer of knowledge and skills to other contexts. The requirements of curriculum construction and instructional design that effectively move children through the "learning to read" stage to the "reading to learn" stage are simply too important to leave to the judgment of individuals. The better the core addresses instructional priorities, the less teachers will need to supplement and modify instruction for the majority of learners.

# 3. What process should be used to select a core reading program?

Ideally, every teacher involved in reading instruction would be involved in the review and selection of the core reading program. Realistically, a grade-level representative may be responsible for the initial review and reduce the "possible" options to a reasonable number. At minimum, we recommend that grade-level representatives use the criteria that follow and then share those findings with grade-level teams.

Schools often ask whether the adoption should be K-6 or whether a K-3/4-6 adoption is advisable. Ideally, there would be consensus across grades K-6; however, it is imperative to give priority to how children are taught to learn to read. Therefore, kindergarten and first grades are critical grades and should be weighted heavily in adoption decisions. This may entail a different adoption for grades 4-6.

# 4. What criteria should be used to select a core reading program?

Few core reading programs have undergone the rigorous level of evaluation currently required to satisfy scientific standards of causal evidence (What Works Clearinghouse, 2002). Nonetheless, a converging body of scientific evidence is available and accessible to guide the development of primary-grade reading programs. We know from research the critical skills and strategies that children must acquire in order to become successful readers by grade 3 (National Reading Panel, 2000, National Research Council, 1998; NICHD, 1996, Simmons & Kameenui, 1998). Following, we specify criteria for reviewing critical elements of reading organized by grade.

### Stage I: Is There Trustworthy Evidence of Program Efficacy?

Prior scientific studies of program efficacy should be a first-order criterion to identify the pool of possible core programs. Your review of programs should answer the following questions:

- \_ 1. Does the program have evidence of efficacy established through carefully designed experimental studies? (See standards specified by the What Works Clearinghouse).
- 2. Does the program reflect current and confirmed research in reading?
- 3. Does the program provide explicit, systematic instruction in the primary grades (K-3) on the following dimensions:
  - phonemic awareness (grades K-1)
  - phonics and word analysis
  - fluency
  - vocabulary
  - comprehension (listening and reading)
- 4. Was the program tested in schools and classrooms with similar demographic and learner profiles as your school?

If the answers to questions 1-4 are yes, you have evidence to indicate that if adopted and implemented faithfully, there is high probability the program will be effective.

If you can narrow your selection to programs with trustworthy evidence, proceed to Stage II for more comprehensive analysis.

If you cannot select a program because of a lack of prior evidence of efficacy, we recommend that you conduct an analysis of the components of the program. A lack of program efficacy should not exclude a program from consideration. Your analysis of critical elements, however, assumes greater importance.

A new generation of reading programs is currently finding its way into the marketplace; a generation of programs that holds great promise yet lacks evidence of efficacy. New programs often do not have adequate levels of evidence because large-scale, longitudinal evidence is costly and difficult to obtain. If programs lack established program efficacy, evaluate the program carefully and thoroughly according to following elements described in this guide.

## Stage II: A Consumer's Guide to Selecting a Core Program: A Critical Elements Analysis

A key assumption of a core program is that it will (a) address all grade-level content standards and (b) ensure that high priority standards are taught in sufficient depth, breadth, and quality that all learners will achieve or exceed expected levels of proficiency. All standards are not equally important. Our critical elements analysis focuses on those skills and strategies essential for early reading.

#### **General Review Process**

- 1. Scope of Review
  - Review each critical element for each grade.
- 2. Type of Review and Sampling Procedure

To gain a representative sample of the program, we recommend the following strategies:

(a) Within lesson procedure (W) involves identifying the first day (lesson) in which a critical skill or strategy (e.g., letter sound correspondence, word reading, identifying main idea) is introduced and following that skill over a sequence of 2-3 days. Then, repeating the process to document evidence at two other points in time (e.g., middle/end of program) where new skills or strategies are introduced. In the evidence columns, document the lesson/unit number to reference the specific information you reviewed.

- (b) Scope and sequence procedure (SS) involves using the scope and sequence to identify the initial instruction in a skill or strategy area (e.g., phonemic awareness, fluency) and analyze how instruction progresses over time.

  Document progression in the evidence columns by indicating unit, lesson, section numbers you reviewed.
- (c) Skills trace procedure (ST) will be used for selected skills and is designed to provide in-depth analysis of the sequence and review schedule of instruction. (See attached description of the procedure.)

#### 3. Documenting Evidence

On the review forms there is space to document specific information. Example information may include lesson number, particular skill/strategy introduced, etc.

#### 4. Calculating Scores and Summarizing Findings

Criteria are calculated at the Critical Element level by grade and across Critical Elements by grade level. At the end of each critical element, tally the number of consistently, partially, and does not satisfy criterion scores.

#### 5. Grade Level Design Features Analysis

At the end of each grade, there are 4-6 overarching items to assess the design, coherence, and systematic nature of instruction across lessons in the program. These items are intended to provide a big picture analysis.

## Use the following criteria for each critical element:

- Element consistently meets/exceeds criterion. Use this rating when the majority of lessons you review meet or exceed the criterion.
- **O** = Element partially meets/exceeds criterion. Use this item when instruction meets the criterion in one instance but not in the other or when the instruction only partially satisfied the criterion.
  - = Element does not satisfy criterion.

When evaluating individual elements, slash (/) the respective circle that represents your rating (e.g., ) or put an X in the box below the appropriate circle.

#### Type of Review

- 1. (w) = Within a sequence of lessons. A specified element is best analyzed by reviewing a particular lesson or a series of 2-3 successive lessons.
- 2. (ss) = Scope and sequence. A specified element is best analyzed by reviewing the program's scope and sequence.
- 3. (st) = Skills trace. A specified element is best analyzed by completing a skills trace over a series of 10 consecutive lessons.

## **Getting Started**

- 1. Review the organization of the Consumer's Guide
  - a. Critical elements
  - b. Format for scoring and documenting evidence
  - c. Summary of sufficient and insufficient quality
- 2. Preview the items within a critical element (e.g., phonemic awareness, fluency) to provide an advance organizer.
- 3. For within (w) lesson items, identify "anchor" lessons you will use. For example, select lessons that teach critical skills. Select lessons that

- represent initial instruction. You will find you can use these anchor lessons to address many of the "w" items.
- 4. Be sure to document your reference points carefully. Include the grade level, unit number, lesson number, page number in case there is need to reconcile discrepant scores.
- 5. Cross reference what is reported in the scope and sequence by actually going to the lesson number in which skills/strategies are taught. Use the scope and sequence as a guide but not as a source.

Program Name:	Date of Publication:
Publisher:	Reviewer Code:
The program meets the following criteria for a comprehensive/core program and will be evaluated using the Consumer's Guide.  Includes comprehensive materials for grades K-3.  Provides instruction in each of the critical elements.  phonemic awareness  phonics and word analysis  fluency vocabulary comprehension	Provides instruction in each of the critical elements phonemic awareness phonics and word analysis fluency vocabulary comprehension  3 The program meets criteria for a supplemental or intervention program and will be reviewed for that purpose Provides targeted instruction on specific skill (select all that apply) phonemic awareness
The program does not meet the following criteria for a comprehensive/core program and will be evaluated using the Consumer's Guide (select all that apply).  Includes comprehensive materials for grades K-3.	phonics and word analysis  phonics and word analysis  fluency  vocabulary  comprehension
	Specify for which Grade/Age the program is appropriate.

**Phonemic Awareness** is the ability to hear and manipulate the sound structure of language. It is a strong predictor of reading success. Phonemic awareness is an auditory skill and consists of multiple components.

	Phonological and Phonemic Awareness Instruction			
Datina	Criterion	Evidence		
Rating	Criterion	Initial Instruction	Week	Week
	1. Progresses from the easier phonemic awareness activities to the more difficult (e.g., isolation, blending, segmentation, and manipulation). (ss)			
	2. Teaches new phonemic awareness skills explicitly using multiple models. (w)			
	3. Teaches phonemic awareness skills systematically. (w)			
	4. Following teacher models, provides multiple opportunities for students to respond orally. (w)			
	5. Integrates letter-sound correspondence instruction to phonological awareness/phonemic awareness. (w)			
	6. In second half of kindergarten, focuses on segmentation or the combination of blending and segmentation. (ss)			
• 0 0	7. Analyzes words at the phoneme level			

Phonological and	Phonemic Awareness In	struction	
(e.g., working with individual sounds within words). <i>(ss)</i>			
8. Focuses beginning instruction on the phonemic level of phonological units with short words (two to three phonemes; e.g., at, mud, run). (ss)			
9. Makes students' cognitive manipulations of sounds overt by using auditory cues or manipulatives that signal the movement of one sound to the next. (w)			
10. Focuses first on the initial sound ( $\underline{sat}$ ), then on the final sound ( $\underline{sat}$ ), and lastly on the medial sound ( $\underline{sat}$ ) in words. ( $\underline{ss}$ )			
11. Allocates appropriate amount of time on high priority phonemic awareness skills (e.g., initial sound, blending, segmenting, manipulating). (w) and (ss)			
IZ' 1 A DI L' A L' A	,.		
Kindergarten Phonemic Awareness Instruc	tion		$\bigcirc$
Tally the number of elements with each rat	ing.	_	_

Reviewer Code/Name: \_\_\_\_\_

**Phonics** is the ability to recognize words accurately, fluently, and independently and is fundamental to reading in an alphabetic writing system. For kindergarten students, critical skills include learning to associate sounds with letters, using those associations to decode and read simple words, and learning to recognize important nondecodable words.

	Letter-Sound Association Instruction				
Dating	Criterion		Evidence		
Rating	Criterion	Initial Instruction	Week	Week	
	1. Introduces high-utility letter sound instruction early in the sequence (e.g., /m/, /s/, /a/, /r/, /t/) instead of low-utility letter sounds (e.g., /x/, /y/, /z/). (ss)				
	2. Explicitly models the introduction of the new sound of a letter prior to student practice and assessment. (w)				
	3. Incorporates frequent and cumulative review of taught letter sounds to automaticity. <i>(st)</i>				
	4. Sequences the introduction of letter sounds in ways that minimize confusion (e.g., sequence /p/, /b/, /v/; /e/, /i/). (ss)				
	5. Includes a few short vowels early in the sequence so that students can use letter-sound knowledge to segment and blend words. (ss)				
	ndergarten Letter-Sound Association Instru-		_ • 0	0	

Decoding Instruction				
Dating	Criterion	Evidence		
Rating	Criterion	Initial Instruction	Week	Week
	1. Provides explicit strategy for blending words. (w)			
	2. Provides multiple opportunities within lessons for students to blend and read words. (w)			
	3. Introduces regular words for which students know all letter sounds. (ss)			
	4. Provides sufficient guided practice in decodable word lists and short, controlled connected text for students to develop automaticity. (w) and (ss)			
	5. Introduces regular word types (e.g., VC, CV, or CVC) first in the sequence of decodable words. <i>(ss)</i>			
	Kindergarten Decoding Instruction  Tally the number of elements with each r	rating	• •	_
	rany the number of elements with each f	aung.		

	Irr	egular Words Instructio	n	
Dating	Criterion	Evidence		
Rating	Criterion	Initial Instruction	Week	Week
	1. Introduces words of high utility (e.g., I, have, etc.). (w)			
	2. Provides ample practice and review of words to develop automaticity. (w) and (st)			
	3. Preteaches irregular words prior to using them in text. (w)			
	4. Limits # of words introduced within a lesson. (w)			
	5. Separates highly similar words (e.g., was/saw). (w) and (ss)			
	Kindergarten Irregular Words Instruct		_ • •	_

Vocabulary refers to the words we must know to communicate effectively. In general, vocabulary can be described as oral vocabulary or reading vocabulary. Oral vocabulary refers to words that we use in speaking or recognize in listening. Reading vocabulary refers to words we recognize or use in print.

	Vocabulary Instruction			
Dating	Criterion	Evidence		
Rating	Criterion	Initial Instruction	Week	Week
	1. Provides explicit instruction of specific concepts and vocabulary. (w)			
	2. Selects words that are highly useful for passage understanding and later learning. (w)			
	3. Explains meanings of words in everyday language. (w)			
	4. Provides repeated and multiple exposures to critical vocabulary in a variety of contexts. (w) and (st)			
	5. Integrates words into sentences and asks students to tell the meanings of the words in the sentences. (w)			
	6. Engages students in processing word meanings at a deeper level (e.g., associating new words with known words). (w)			

	Voc	abulary Instruction		
	7. Reviews previously introduced words cumulatively. <i>(st)</i>			
	8. Incorporates exposure to a broad and diverse vocabulary through listening to a wide range of stories and informational texts. (ss)			
Kind	ergarten Vocabulary Instruction			
Tally	the number of elements with each rating.	_	_ • _ •	

**Listening Comprehension:** The ability to listen to stories, answer questions, sequence events, learn new vocabulary, and retell information heard are the foundation of reading comprehension. Because many kindergarten children cannot yet read stories, it is imperative that they have frequent and rich opportunities to listen to and discuss stories and informational text that will extend their current understandings and vocabulary knowledge.

	Lis	tening Comprehension		
Datina	Cuitarian		Evidence	
Rating	Criterion	Initial Instruction	Week	Week
	Explicitly teaches critical comprehension strategies. (w)     Literal comprehension     Retelling, main idea			
	2. Models and guides students through story structure (e.g., setting), thinking out loud as the elements are being identified. (w)			
	3. Strategically selects and reinforces critical vocabulary during story reading (connects with background knowledge and examples). (w) and (ss)			
	4. Provides plentiful opportunities to listen to and explore narrative and expository text forms and to engage in interactive discussion of the messages and meanings of the text. (ss)			
	5. Focuses on only a few important story/text elements and introduces additional elements when the students can reliably identify those previously taught.  (w)			

Lis	tening Comprehension		
6. Models multiple examples and provides extensive guided practice in listening-comprehension strategies. (w)			
7. Inserts questions at strategic intervals to reduce the memory load for learners when introducing strategies in stories. (For example, have students retell the important events after each page rather than wait for the end of the story.) (w)			
ndergarten Listening Comprehension Illy the number of elements with each rating		• • _	

# **Summary of Kindergarten Instruction Ratings**

Phonemic Awareness Instruction (11)	• o o
Letter-Sound Association Instruction (5)	• 0 0
Decoding Instruction (5)	• 0 0
Irregular Words Instruction (5)	
Vocabulary Instruction (8)	• o o
Listening Comprehension Instruction (7)	• o o
Kindergarten Instruction Totals (41)	_ • _ • _ •

Kindergarten Design Features
1. Coordinates and integrates <u>phonemic awareness</u> and <u>phonics</u> instruction and student materials.
2. Provides ample practice on high-priority skills.
3. Provides explicit instruction.
4. Provides systematic instruction by careful selection and extension of examples.
5. Includes systematic and cumulative review of high priority skills.
6. Demonstrates and builds relationships between fundamental skills leading to higher order skills.

SUMI	MARY
<b>Evidence of Sufficient Instructional Quality (specify elements)</b>	<b>Evidence of Insufficient Instructional Quality (specify elements)</b>

Additional Comments

**Phonemic Awareness** is the ability to hear and manipulate the sound structure of language. It is a strong predictor of reading success. Phonemic awareness is an auditory skill and consists of multiple components.

	Phonemic Awareness Instruction				
Dating	Criterion		Evidence		
Rating	Criterion	Initial Instruction	Week	Week	
	1. Allocates appropriate amount of daily time to blending, segmenting, and manipulating tasks until proficient. (w)				
	2. Incorporates letters into phonemic awareness activities. (w)				
	3. Teaches new skills explicitly. (w)				
	4. Analyzes words at the phoneme level (i.e., working with individual sounds within words). (w) and (ss)				
	5. Works with phonemes in all positions in words (initial, final, medial). (ss)				
	6. Progresses from identifying or distinguishing the positions of sounds in words to producing the sound and adding, deleting, and changing selected sounds. (ss)				

Phonemic Awareness Instruction						
	7. Works with increasingly longer words (three to four phonemes) to include more complex phonemic structures (consonant blends). <i>(ss)</i>					

First Grade Phonemic Awareness Instruction
Tally the number of elements with each rating.

	Phonics and Word Analysis Instruction				
Rating	Criterion	Evidence			
Kating	Criterion	Initial Instruction	Week	Week	
	1. Progresses systematically from simple word types (e.g., consonant-vowel-consonant) and word lengths (e.g., number of phonemes) and word complexity (e.g., phonemes in the word, position of blends, stop sounds) to more complex words. (ss)				
	2. Models initial instruction at each of the fundamental stages (e.g., letter-sound correspondences, blending, reading whole words). (w) and (ss)				
	3. Provides teacher-guided practice in controlled word lists and connected text in which students can apply their newly learned skills successfully. (w)				
	4. Includes repeated opportunities to read words in contexts in which students can apply their knowledge of letter-sound correspondences. (w) and (ss)				
	5. Uses decodable text based on specific phonics lessons in the early part of the first grade as an intervening step between explicit skill acquisition and the students' ability to read quality literature and informational text. Decodable texts should contain the phonics elements and sight words that students have been taught. (w) and (ss)				

Phonics and Word Analysis Instruction						
6. Sequences words strategically to incorporate known letters or letter-sound combinations. (w) and (ss)						
7. Begins instruction in word families and word patterns (i.e., reading orthographic units of text, such as <i>at, sat, fat, rat</i> ) after students have learned the letter-sound correspondences in the unit. (ss)						
8. Teaches students to process larger, highly represented patterns to increase fluency in word recognition. (w)						
First Grade Phonics and Word Analysis Instruction  Tally the number of elements with each rating						

Irregular Words Instruction				
Dating	Criterion		Evidence	
Rating	Criterion	Initial Instruction	Week	Week
	1. Selects words of high utility. (w)			
	2. Controls the number of irregular words introduced at one time. (w)			
	3. Preteaches irregular words prior to reading connected text. (w)			
	4. Strategically separates the introduction of new high-frequency words (e.g., was, saw; them, they, there), that are often confused by students. (st)			
	5. Points out irregularities while focusing student attention on all letters in the word. (w)			
	6. Provides ample practice and cumulative review of important high frequency irregular words. (w) and (st)			
	First Grade Irregular Words Instruction  Tally the number of elements with each rating	g	• _ 0 _	_

Text Reading and Fluency Instruction				
Rating	Criterion		Evidence	
Kating	Criterion	Initial Instruction	Week	Week
	1. Introduces sentence/passage reading soon after students can read a sufficient number of words accurately. (w) and (ss)			
	2. Contains regular words comprised of letter-sounds, phonic elements, and word types that have been taught. (w) and (ss)			
	3. Contains only high-frequency irregular words that have been previously taught. (ss)			
	4. Introduces fluency practice (e.g., repeated reading) after students read words in passages accurately. (ss)			
	5. Uses initial stories and text composed of a high percentage of regular words and pretaught irregular words. (w)			
	6. Builds toward established and recognized fluency goals, including end of grade fluency goal between 40-60 wcpm. (ss)			
	7. Includes sufficient independent practice materials of appropriate difficulty for students to develop fluency. (w) and (ss)			

First Grade Text Reading & Fluency Instruction
Tally the number of elements with each rating.

Reviewer Code/Name:

**\_\_ • \_\_ •** \_\_ •

Vocabulary Instruction				
Dating	Criterion	Evidence		
Rating	Criterion	Initial Instruction	Week	Week
	1. Provides explicit instruction of specific concepts and vocabulary. (w)			
	2. Selects words that are highly useful for passage understanding and later learning. (w)			
	3. Explains meanings of words in everyday language. (w)			
	4. Provides repeated and multiple exposures to critical vocabulary in a variety of contexts. (w) and (st)			
	5. Integrates words into sentences and asks students to tell the meaning of the word in the sentence and to use it in a variety of contexts. (w)			
	6. Engages students in processing word meanings at a deeper level (e.g., associating new words with known words). (w)			
	7. Reviews previously introduced words cumulatively. <i>(st)</i>			

Vocabulary Instruction					
8. Incorporates exposure to a broad and diverse vocabulary through listening to a wide range of stories and informational texts. <i>(ss)</i>					
Grade Vocabulary Instruction the number of elements with each rating.		_ • • _	_ 0		

Reading Comprehension Instruction				
Dating	Criterion		Evidence	
Rating	Criterion	Initial Instruction	Week	Week
	1. Explicitly teaches critical comprehension strategies (e.g., main idea, literal, inferential, retell, prediction) with the aid of carefully designed examples. (w) and (ss)			
	2. Teaches background information or activates prior knowledge to increase student's understanding of what is to be read. (w)			
	3. Provides guided practice and systematic review of critical comprehension strategies. (st)			
	4. Guides students through sample text in which teachers think out loud as they identify the components of story structure. (w)			
	5. Provides plentiful opportunities to listen to and explore narrative and expository text forms and to engage in interactive discussion of the messages and meanings of the text. (ss)			
	6. Connects previously taught skills and strategies with new content and text. (w) and (ss)			

Reading Comprehension Instruction						
<ul> <li>7. The text for initial instruction in comprehension: <ul> <li>begins with text units appropriate for the learner</li> <li>uses familiar vocabulary</li> <li>activates prior knowledge</li> <li>uses simple sentences</li> <li>begins with short passages to reduce the memory load for learners.</li> </ul> </li> <li>(w)</li> </ul>						
8. Introduces text where the structure of text is explicit (beginning, middle, and end being obvious). (w)						
First Grade Reading Comprehension Instru Tally the number of elements with each rat		_ • • _	_			

# **Summary of First Grade Instruction Ratings**

Items			
Phonemic Awareness Instruction (7)	• o o		
Phonics and Word Analysis Instruction (8)	• o o		
Irregular Words Instruction (6)	• 0 0		
Text Reading and Fluency Instruction (7)	• 0 0		
Vocabulary Development (8)	• 0 0		
Reading Comprehension Instruction (8)	• • •		
First Grade Instruction Totals (44)	OO		

First Grade Design Features			
	1. Aligns and coordinates the words used in phonics/word recognition activities with those used in fluency building.		
	2. Provides ample practice on high-priority skills.		
	3. Provides explicit instruction on new skills/strategies.		
	4. Includes systematic and cumulative review of high priority skills.		
	5. Demonstrates and builds relationships between fundamental skills leading to higher order skills.		

SUMMARY				
<b>Evidence of Sufficient Instructional Quality (specify elements)</b>	<b>Evidence of Insufficient Instructional Quality (specify elements)</b>			

Additional Comments    Comments

**Phonics** is the ability to recognize words accurately, fluently, and independently and is fundamental to reading in an alphabetic writing system. For kindergarten students, critical skills include learning to associate sounds with letters, using those associations to decode and read simple words, and learning to recognize important nondecodable words.

Phonics and Word Analysis Instruction					
Rating Criterion -		Evidence			
	Initial Instruction	Week	Week		
	1. Teaches new advanced phonic-analysis skills explicitly. (w)				
	2. Integrates and demonstrates application of new skills in words and connected text and applies to other program materials (e.g., trade books, anthologies) when students are proficient. (w) and (ss)				
	3. Teaches explicit strategy to read multisyllabic words by using prefixes, suffixes, and known word parts. (w)				
	4. Explicitly teaches and provides opportunity to process larger, highly represented patterns (e.g., ight, ing) to increase fluency in word recognition (w)				
	5. Separates auditorily and visually similar letter combinations in the instructional sequence (e.g., does not introduce both sounds for <i>oo</i> simultaneously; separates <i>ai</i> , <i>au</i> ). (w) and (ss)				

Phonics and Word Analysis Instruction			
	6. Offers repeated opportunities for students to read words in contexts where they can apply their advanced phonics skills with a high level of success. (w) and (ss)		
	7. Makes the connections between decoding (symbol to sound) and spelling (sound to symbol). (w)		
	8. Incorporates and integrates spelling to reinforce phonics and word analysis. (w) and (ss)		
	ond Grade Phonics and Word Analysis Instruction of elements with each rating.	ruction • • • •	)

Irregular Words Instruction				
Pating	Criterion	Evidence		
Rating Criterion	Initial Instruction	Week	Week	
	1. Selects words that have high utility (i.e., words that are used frequently in grade-appropriate literature and informational text). (ss)			
	2. Limits the number of irregular words introduced at one time. (w)			
	3. Preteaches the irregular words prior to reading connected text. (w)			
	4. Provides ample practice and cumulative review of important high-frequency irregular words. <i>(st)</i>			
	Second Grade Irregular Words Instructio Tally the number of elements with each r		• _ 0 _	_

Text Reading and Fluency Instruction				
Rating Criterion —	Cuitarian	Evidence		
	Initial Instruction	Week	Week	
	1. Selects majority of high frequency irregular words from list of commonly used words in English. (ss)			
	2. Builds toward a minimum 90 word-per-minute fluency goal by end of grade 2. (ss)			
	3. Introduces repeated readings and other fluency building strategies after students read words in passages accurately. (w)			
	4. Includes sufficient independent practice materials of appropriate difficulty for students to develop fluency. (w)			

Second Grade Text Reading and Fluency Instruction
Tally the number of elements with each rating.

Vocabulary Instruction					
Rating	Criterion	Evidence			
Rating	Criterion	Initial Instruction	Week	Week	
	1. Provides explicit instruction of specific concepts and vocabulary essential to understanding text. (w)				
	2. Explains meanings of words in everyday language. (w)				
	3. Selects words that are highly useful for passage understanding and later learning. (w)				
	4. Reviews previously introduced words cumulatively. <i>(st)</i>				
	5. Engages students in processing word meanings at a deeper level (e.g., associating new words with known words). (w)				
	6. Provides repeated and multiple exposures to critical vocabulary in a variety of contexts. (w) and (st)				
	7. Explicitly teaches strategies to use context to gain meanings of an unfamiliar word. (Context includes the words surrounding the unfamiliar word that provide information to its meaning). (w)				

Vocabulary Instruction					
8. Extends the understanding of concepts and vocabulary through explicitly teaching antonyms and synonyms, using individual words in compound words to predict meaning, using prefixes and suffixes to assist in word meaning, and learning simple multiple meaning words. (w)					
9. Incorporates exposure to a broad and diverse vocabulary through listening to and reading stories and informational texts. <i>(ss)</i>					
10. Integrates words into sentences and asks students to demonstrate meaning of the word in oral/written sentences. (w)					
11. Teaches explicit strategy for deriving word meanings based on meaning of prefixes, suffixes, and roots. (w)					
12. Uses the word in a variety of contexts.					
13. Initially teaches prefix/suffice strategy in familiar words. (w)					

Second Grade Vocabulary Instruction

Tally the number of elements with each rating.

Reviewer Code/Name:

\_\_ • \_\_ • \_\_ c

Reading Comprehension Instruction				
Dating	Criterion	Evidence		
Rating	Criterion	Initial Instruction	Week	Week
	1. Explicitly teaches new comprehension skills or strategies (e.g., comprehension monitoring, summarizing) with the aid of carefully designed examples and practice. (w) and (ss)			
	2. Explicitly teaches conventions of informational text (e.g., titles, chapter headings) to locate important information. (w) and (ss)			
	3. Teaches explicit strategy to interpret information from graphs, diagrams, and charts. (w) and (ss)			
	4. Teaches or activates prior knowledge to increase a student's understanding of what is read.  (w)			
	5. Provides guided practice and systematic review of critical strategies across several lessons. (w) and (ss)			

Reading Comprehension Instruction					
6. Continues skill or strategy instruction across several instructional sessions to illustrate the applicability and utility of the skill or strategy. (st)					
7. Uses story grammar structure as a tool for prompting information to compare and contrast, organize information, and group related ideas to maintain a consistent focus. (w)					
8. Teaches and applies comprehension strategies to both narrative and expository text. (ss)					
9. Connects previously taught skills and strategies with new content and text. (w) and (ss)					
10. Cumulatively builds a repertoire of skills and strategies that are introduced, applied, and integrated with appropriate texts and for authentic purposes over the course of the year. (ss)					
11. Teaches analyzing elements of narrative text and comparing and contrasting elements within and among texts. (w)					
Second Grade Reading Comprehensi  Tally the number of elements with ea		• • _	O		

## **Summary of Second Grade Instruction Ratings**

Phonics & Word Analysis Instruction (8)	
Irregular Words Instruction (4)	
Text Reading & Fluency Instruction (4)	
Vocabulary Instruction (13)	
Reading Comprehension Instruction (11)	• 0 0
Second Grade Instruction Totals (40)	_ • _ 0 _ 0

Second Grade Design Features					
	1. Aligns and coordinates the words used in phonics/word recognition activities with those used in fluency building.				
	2. Provides ample practice on high-priority skills.				
	3. Provides explicit and systematic instruction.				
	4. Includes systematic and cumulative review of high priority skills.				
0	5. Demonstrates and builds relationships between fundamental skills leading to higher order skills.				

Additional Comments				
Additional Comments				

Phonics and Word Analysis Instruction					
Datina	Cuitanian	Evidence			
Rating	Criterion	Initial Instruction	Week	Week	
	1. Explicitly teaches strategies to decode multisyllabic words using the structural and morphological features of such word parts as affixes (e.g., <i>pre-, mis-,-tion</i> ) to aid in word recognition. (w)				
	2. Provides sufficient practice in reading harder and bigger words (i.e., multisyllabic words) and reading all words more fluently. (ss)				
	3. Incorporates spelling to reinforce word analysis. (w)				
	4. Introduces and emphasizes word parts that occur with high frequency over those that occur in only a few words. (w)				
	5. Extends instruction and provides practice on orthographically larger and more complex units (e.g., <i>ight, aught, own</i> ). <i>(ss)</i>				
	6. Teaches the appropriate usage of structural analysis to complement other word identification strategies. (w)				

Third Grade Phonics and Word Analysis Instruction
Tally the number of elements with each rating.

	Text Reading and Fluency Instruction					
Rating	Criterion	Evidence				
Kating	Criterion	Initial Instruction	Week	Week		
	1. Introduces repeated readings and other fluency building strategies after students read words in passages accurately. (w)					
	2. Includes sufficient independent practice materials of appropriate difficulty for students to develop fluency. (w)					
	3. Builds toward a 120 word-per-minute fluency goal by end of grade. (ss)					
	4. Passages/texts include high proportion of words students can read successfully (i.e., words and word types that have been previously taught). (w)					
Third Grade Text Reading and Fluency Instruction Tally the number of elements with each rating.						

Vocabulary Instruction					
D -4in -	Cuitania n		Evidence		
Rating	Criterion	Initial Instruction	Week	Week	

Critical Elements Analysis

Vocabulary Instruction						
	the meaning of an unknown word. (w)					
	9. Extends the understanding of concepts and vocabulary of the English language through (1) learning and using antonyms and synonyms; (2) using individual words in compound words to predict the meaning; (3) using prefixes and suffixes to assist in word meaning; and (4) learning simple multiplemeaning words. (w)					
	Third Grade Vocabulary Instruction	_	_			
,	Tally the number of elements with each ratir	ng.	_ O O			

	Reading Comprehension Instruction				
Rating	Criterion		Evidence		
Kating	Criterion	Initial Instruction	Week	Week	
	1. Teaches background information and/or activates prior knowledge. (w)				
	2. Uses text for initial instruction in which the main idea or comprehension unit is explicitly stated, clear, and in which the ideas follow a logical order. (w)				
	3. Continues skill or strategy instruction across several instructional sessions to illustrate the applicability and utility of the skill or strategy. (w) and (st)				
	4. Connects previously taught skills and strategies with new content and text. (w) and (ss)				
	5. Cumulatively builds a repertoire of multiple strategies that are introduced, applied, and integrated with appropriate texts and for authentic purposes over the course of the year. (w) and (ss)				
	6. Explicitly teaches comprehension strategies with the aid of carefully designed and multiple examples and practice (e.g., comprehension monitoring, mental imagery, question generation, question answering, story structure, summarization). (w)				

	Reading Co	mprehension Instru	ction			
Datina	Cuitanian		Evidence			
Rating	Criterion	Initial Instruction	Week	Week		
7. Progresses to more complex structures in which main ideas are not explicit and passages are longer. (w) and (ss)						
	Third Grade Reading Comprehension Instruct Tally the number of elements with each rating		• • _	0		
	Summary of Thi	ird Grade Instructio	on Ratings			
	Phonics and Word Analysis Instruction (6)		_ 0 0			
	Text Reading and Fluency Instruction (4)		_ 0 0			
Vocabulary Instruction (9)						
Reading Comprehension Instruction (7)						
	Third Grade Instruction Totals (26)	•	<b>. O</b> O			
	Third Grad	le Design Features				
<b>O</b>   1.	Provides ample practice on high-priority skill	ls.				
	Provides explicit and systematic instruction.					
	Includes systematic and cumulative review of					
<b>Q</b> (4.	Demonstrates and builds relationships between	en fundamental skills lea	ding to higher order skills.			

SUMMARY				
<b>Evidence of Sufficient Instructional Quality (specify elements)</b>	<b>Evidence of Insufficient Instructional Quality (specify elements)</b>			

Additional Comments			

## **Overall Assessment of Instructional Sufficiency by Critical Element and Grade**

PROGRAM NAME:	
---------------	--

Critical Element	Kindergarten	First Grade
Phonemic Awareness	• o o	• o o
Phonics and Word Analysis	• • •	• • •
Fluency	N/A	• 0 0
Vocabulary	• • •	• • •
Comprehension	• • •	• • •
Design Features	• • •	• 0 0
Critical Element	Second Grade	Third Grade
Phonemic Awareness	N/A	N/A
Phonics and Word Analysis	• • •	• 0 0
Fluency	• • •	• • •
Vocabulary	• • •	• • •
Comprehension	• • •	• • •
Design Features	<b>_</b> • _ • _ •	<b> 0 </b> 0

Use the following criteria for each critical element:

) =	Element r	neets/	exceeds	crit	erion
,	LICITICITE	110013/	CACCCUS	CIII	CLIUL

(	0	=	Element partially meets/exceeds criterion
1	_		Broment partially meets, eneceds enterior